

对比讲评的材料准备：一篇病文和一篇范文怎么选、怎么标

对比讲评课上一半的成败在备课阶段选材料。选错一篇，整节课变成教师独角戏。

病文的选择标准有三条。一、毛病要典型：只写结果、过程笼统，这正是全班共病，学生一看就认得出「这也是我的写法」。二、不能差到离谱：全文错别字连篇或跑题的病文会把讨论带偏，讲评课讲的是「写不具体」，不是「写不端正」。三、篇幅要短：一百二十字以内，投影后全班十秒读完，省下的时间全给对比。最好的病文来源是本届学生上学期的旧作文，匿名处理后使用，学生知道这是自己班写的，代入感最强。

范文的选择标准也有三条。一、够得着：范文水平是「比全班好一点」，不是发表级美文，否则学生只会说「人家写得好」而不知道好在哪。二、同题同素材：也写学游泳，也写泳池，连泳姿都尽量一致，对比才公平。三、只强在一点：范文只在「一个瞬间拆成多个动作」这一点上强，其他方面与全班持平，一节课只解决一个病。

标注方法固定三样。病文用波浪线标出三句主干，让学生一眼看到全文只有骨架；范文用圆圈圈出动词，一节课圈四个以内，圈多了学生记不住重点；两文之间画顺序箭头，病文的箭头只有三个点，范文的箭头下面每个点挂着两三个动作，差距可视化。

挑材料的三个渠道：本届旧作文按毛病筛，上学期的作文里专挑「只有结果」的；教师自己下水写病文，按全班典型毛病定制，缺点是代入感弱一点；教参范文库做兜底，只在前两个渠道都没有时用。学生作文入投影前做脱敏：改名字、改班级、改学校地名，涉及真实事故（如溺水经历）的段落不用。

备课自测一句话：把两文并排给搭班老师看三十秒，问「差距在哪」，对方能用一句话说出「一个有动作一个没有」，材料就算选对了；对方若说「范文写得好」，说明范文超纲，换掉重选。

Preparing Contrast Materials: How to Choose and Mark a Sick Essay and a Model Essay

Half of a contrast feedback lesson is won or lost at the material-picking stage. Pick one wrong text and the whole period becomes a teacher solo.

Three standards for the sick essay. One: the fault must be typical, result only and process vague, the shared illness of the whole class, so students recognize it as their own way of writing. Two: not catastrophically bad, an essay covered in misspellings or off topic drags the discussion away, the lesson treats vagueness, not sloppiness. Three: keep it short, under one hundred and twenty words, readable in ten seconds on the projector, and every saved second goes to the contrast. The best source is last term compositions of the same students, used after anonymizing, since knowing it was written by their own class gives the strongest immersion.

Three standards for the model. One: reachable, a level of just a bit better than the class, not publishable beauty, or students only say they write well without knowing where. Two: same topic and same material, also swimming, also a pool, ideally the same stroke, so the contrast is fair. Three: strong in exactly one point, splitting one moment into several actions, while everything else stays at class level, one lesson cures one illness.

Three fixed markings. Wave lines under the three trunk sentences of the sick essay, so the skeleton is visible at a glance; circles around the verbs of the model, no more than four per lesson, more than that and the point is lost; order arrows between the two texts, three bare dots on the sick side, each dot on the model side hanging two or three actions, the gap made visible.

Three channels for materials: filter old compositions of this cohort for the result-only fault; the teacher writes a custom sick essay targeting the class illness, slightly weaker in immersion; a teaching reference library as fallback, only when the first two channels fail. Anonymize before projecting: change names, classes, and place names, and never use passages about real accidents such as drowning experiences.

One self-test while preparing: show the two texts side by side to a colleague for thirty seconds and ask where the gap is. If they answer in one sentence, one has actions and one does not, the materials are right. If they say the model is well written, the model is out of reach, replace it.